

COMMERCIAL/INDUSTRIAL ECF ANALYSIS FOR MUSKEGON HEIGHTS.

<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>ECF</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Liber/Page</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>	<u>Land and</u>		<u>Sale Price</u>		<u>Cost New Less</u>	<u>Indicated</u>
					<u>Improvements</u>	<u>Buildings</u>	<u>Depreciation</u>	<u>ECF</u>		
26-842-000-0069-20	SHERM	6/10/2021	4264/469	\$ 475,000	\$ 101,729	\$ 373,271	\$ 336,165	1.11		
26-185-176-0011-00	EAST	7/30/2021	4270/20	\$ 70,000	\$ 40,000	\$ 30,000	\$ 22,237	1.35		
26-841-000-0001-00	COMM	4/29/2021	4260/107	\$ 125,000	\$ 37,500	\$ 87,500	\$ 52,090	1.68		
26-185-193-0001-10	20100	5/17/2021	4262/124	\$ 325,000	\$ 48,622	\$ 276,378	\$ 157,057	1.76		
26-650-017-0017-00	COMME	12/9/2021	4283/212	\$ 115,000	\$ 47,714	\$ 67,286	\$ 34,903	1.93		
26-650-017-0012-00	COMME	12/29/2021	4286/226	\$ 33,726	\$ 18,750	\$ 14,976	\$ 6,194	2.42		
						\$ 849,411	\$ 608,646	1.40	ECF	
								1.71	AVE ECF	
								1.72	MEDIAN ECF	

REDUCED COMMERCIAL ECF TO 1.64 FOR 2023. REDUCED INDUSTRIAL ECF AT 1.58.

ECF Analysis: Neighborhoods BROWN, CENTRAL, NORTHEAST, ORANGE, YELLOW

Parcel Number	ECF	Sale Date	Liber/Page	Sale Price	Land and Improvements		Buildings	Sale Price	Cost New Less		Indicated ECF
					Improvements	Buildings			Depreciation	Depreciation	
26-185-143-0019-00	13	9/18/2020	4260/339	\$ 18,400	\$ 4,000	\$ 14,400	\$ 4,000	\$ 14,400	\$ 27,019		0.53
26-540-005-0003-00	1	12/21/2021	4284/955	\$ 16,983	\$ 3,200	\$ 13,783	\$ 3,200	\$ 13,783	\$ 24,821		0.56
26-185-152-0020-00	1	3/15/2021	4253/908	\$ 46,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 38,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 38,000	\$ 67,877		0.56
26-185-176-0024-00	13	3/11/2021	4263/354	\$ 27,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 23,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 23,000	\$ 39,744		0.58
26-185-066-0007-00	1	1/29/2021	4248/27	\$ 40,000	\$ 5,895	\$ 34,105	\$ 5,895	\$ 34,105	\$ 58,739		0.58
26-185-114-0022-00	1	8/31/2021	4272/738	\$ 35,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 31,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 31,000	\$ 52,331		0.59
26-635-257-0001-10	3	3/16/2021	4253/904	\$ 27,000	\$ 6,580	\$ 20,420	\$ 6,580	\$ 20,420	\$ 33,932		0.60
26-635-272-0020-00	9	7/28/2020	4229/229	\$ 36,000	\$ 5,880	\$ 30,120	\$ 5,880	\$ 30,120	\$ 49,487		0.61
26-185-125-0017-00	13	4/26/2021	9999/99	\$ 18,000	\$ 6,000	\$ 12,000	\$ 6,000	\$ 12,000	\$ 19,711		0.61
26-185-215-0010-00	3	2/9/2022	4288/705	\$ 21,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 17,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 17,500	\$ 28,401		0.62
26-185-222-0017-00	3	5/28/2020	4223/283	\$ 22,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 19,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 19,000	\$ 29,492		0.64
26-185-071-0005-00	13	4/2/2021	4256/356	\$ 55,000	\$ 10,470	\$ 44,530	\$ 10,470	\$ 44,530	\$ 68,851		0.65
26-185-117-0004-00	1	6/16/2020	4223/269	\$ 29,000	\$ 5,377	\$ 23,623	\$ 5,377	\$ 23,623	\$ 35,516		0.67
26-185-100-0001-00	1	6/4/2021	4263/857	\$ 17,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 13,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 13,500	\$ 20,181		0.67
26-870-000-0056-00	5	3/16/2022	4292/648	\$ 40,000	\$ 10,150	\$ 29,850	\$ 10,150	\$ 29,850	\$ 44,523		0.67
26-185-222-0010-00	3	1/22/2022	4287/402	\$ 57,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 53,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 53,500	\$ 77,973		0.69
26-185-147-0017-00	1	10/12/2021	4277/27	\$ 25,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 21,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 21,000	\$ 30,067		0.70
26-790-002-0007-00	1	7/31/2020	4228/700	\$ 22,900	\$ 4,000	\$ 18,900	\$ 4,000	\$ 18,900	\$ 26,113		0.72
26-185-117-0012-00	1	6/14/2021	4264/583	\$ 22,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 18,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 18,000	\$ 24,549		0.73
26-185-227-0006-00	3	5/28/2021	4263/202	\$ 75,000	\$ 8,377	\$ 66,623	\$ 8,377	\$ 66,623	\$ 90,560		0.74
26-755-002-0001-00	9	10/5/2021	4276/552	\$ 38,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 35,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 35,000	\$ 46,814		0.75
26-185-058-0002-00	1	8/12/2020	4230/468	\$ 41,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 37,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 37,500	\$ 49,916		0.75
26-185-149-0017-00	1	7/15/2020	4227/144	\$ 24,900	\$ 4,000	\$ 20,900	\$ 4,000	\$ 20,900	\$ 27,268		0.77
26-595-035-0018-00	1	1/4/2022	4287/49	\$ 33,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 29,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 29,000	\$ 37,484		0.77
26-615-006-0011-00	9	12/17/2020	4243/161	\$ 46,000	\$ 5,250	\$ 40,750	\$ 5,250	\$ 40,750	\$ 52,395		0.78
26-870-000-0097-00	5	3/8/2022	4292/206	\$ 44,500	\$ 4,200	\$ 40,300	\$ 4,200	\$ 40,300	\$ 50,405		0.80
26-870-000-0013-00	5	7/19/2021	4269/379	\$ 65,000	\$ 6,707	\$ 58,293	\$ 6,707	\$ 58,293	\$ 72,271		0.81
26-185-224-0019-00	3	11/16/2020	4239/594	\$ 44,000	\$ 10,236	\$ 33,764	\$ 10,236	\$ 33,764	\$ 41,357		0.82
26-415-070-0002-00	1	4/30/2021	4260/524	\$ 50,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 46,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 46,000	\$ 56,166		0.82
26-755-007-0008-00	9	2/25/2022	4290/443	\$ 49,152	\$ 3,500	\$ 45,652	\$ 3,500	\$ 45,652	\$ 55,482		0.82
26-595-057-0020-00	1	4/29/2021	4262/505	\$ 99,900	\$ 8,000	\$ 91,900	\$ 8,000	\$ 91,900	\$ 110,644		0.83
26-185-221-0016-00	3	5/14/2021	4263/265	\$ 23,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 20,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 20,000	\$ 24,045		0.83
26-185-215-0008-00	3	12/10/2020	4249/804	\$ 28,900	\$ 3,500	\$ 25,400	\$ 3,500	\$ 25,400	\$ 30,361		0.84
26-185-221-0012-00	3	6/22/2021	4265/384	\$ 29,000	\$ 3,927	\$ 25,073	\$ 3,927	\$ 25,073	\$ 29,968		0.84
26-874-000-0131-00	5	4/15/2021	4258/600	\$ 215,000	\$ 34,137	\$ 180,863	\$ 34,137	\$ 180,863	\$ 215,510		0.84

26-822-002-0001-00	1	8/18/2021	4273/327	\$	40,000	\$	6,400	\$	33,600	\$	39,999	0.84
26-415-054-0018-00	1	11/23/2020	4240/377	\$	72,500	\$	8,558	\$	63,942	\$	76,112	0.84
26-755-002-0007-00	9	10/28/2021	4283/45	\$	45,000	\$	5,600	\$	39,400	\$	45,498	0.87
26-755-002-0007-00	9	10/27/2021	4283/44	\$	45,000	\$	5,600	\$	39,400	\$	45,498	0.87
26-820-008-0010-10	1	6/17/2020	4223/764	\$	40,000	\$	5,760	\$	34,240	\$	39,482	0.87
26-610-003-0007-00	1	10/6/2020	4241/202	\$	40,000	\$	3,296	\$	36,704	\$	42,242	0.87
26-185-062-0002-00	1	5/27/2020	4221/707	\$	19,000	\$	4,000	\$	15,000	\$	17,132	0.88
26-185-031-0005-00	1	3/10/2022	4291/914	\$	37,000	\$	5,663	\$	31,337	\$	35,380	0.89
26-650-016-0025-00	1	12/15/2020	4242/362	\$	78,000	\$	13,041	\$	64,959	\$	72,778	0.89
				\$		\$		\$	1,631,831	\$	2,164,094	<b>0.75 ECF</b>
											AVERAGE	0.74
											MEDIAN	0.76

USED .75 ECF for above neighborhoods.

ECF Analysis for Neighborhood: Southwest

<u>Parcel Number</u>	<u>ECF</u>	<u>Sale Date</u>	<u>Libert/Page</u>	<u>Sale Price</u>		<u>Land and Improvements</u>		<u>Sale Price Buildings</u>		<u>Cost New Less Depreciation</u>		<u>Indicated ECF</u>
26-770-013-0004-00	10	4/16/2021	4259/122	\$ 24,000	\$ 5,250	\$ 18,750	\$ 36,895	\$ 18,750	\$ 36,895	\$ 18,750	\$ 36,895	0.51
26-770-024-0014-00	10	6/11/2021	4264/748	\$ 18,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 14,500	\$ 27,203	\$ 14,500	\$ 27,203	\$ 14,500	\$ 27,203	0.53
26-770-031-0017-00	10	7/21/2020	4227/864	\$ 20,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 16,500	\$ 30,378	\$ 16,500	\$ 30,378	\$ 16,500	\$ 30,378	0.54
26-770-010-0019-00	10	4/9/2021	4263/142	\$ 19,700	\$ 3,500	\$ 16,200	\$ 29,562	\$ 16,200	\$ 29,562	\$ 16,200	\$ 29,562	0.55
26-400-014-0007-00	10	7/24/2020	4231/76	\$ 30,000	\$ 5,600	\$ 24,400	\$ 40,977	\$ 24,400	\$ 40,977	\$ 24,400	\$ 40,977	0.60
26-835-000-0104-00	10	7/30/2021	4270/28	\$ 31,000	\$ 2,800	\$ 28,200	\$ 44,823	\$ 28,200	\$ 44,823	\$ 28,200	\$ 44,823	0.63
26-770-020-0001-00	10	8/24/2021	4272/965	\$ 20,000	\$ 3,640	\$ 16,360	\$ 25,624	\$ 16,360	\$ 25,624	\$ 16,360	\$ 25,624	0.64
26-400-012-0007-00	10	5/19/2021	4262/511	\$ 40,000	\$ 8,102	\$ 31,898	\$ 49,519	\$ 31,898	\$ 49,519	\$ 31,898	\$ 49,519	0.64
26-770-023-0025-00	10	11/23/2021	4283/65	\$ 28,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 24,500	\$ 35,615	\$ 24,500	\$ 35,615	\$ 24,500	\$ 35,615	0.69
26-770-019-0025-00	10	9/3/2020	4234/194	\$ 30,000	\$ 5,250	\$ 24,750	\$ 35,724	\$ 24,750	\$ 35,724	\$ 24,750	\$ 35,724	0.69
26-770-003-0001-00	10	6/9/2020	4223/270	\$ 41,000	\$ 3,010	\$ 37,990	\$ 54,671	\$ 37,990	\$ 54,671	\$ 37,990	\$ 54,671	0.69
26-770-041-0019-00	10	7/29/2020	4228/502	\$ 35,000	\$ 4,911	\$ 30,089	\$ 43,063	\$ 30,089	\$ 43,063	\$ 30,089	\$ 43,063	0.70
26-770-002-0024-00	10	3/16/2021	4253/764	\$ 34,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 30,500	\$ 42,053	\$ 30,500	\$ 42,053	\$ 30,500	\$ 42,053	0.73
26-770-032-0030-00	10	5/7/2020	4310/859	\$ 35,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 31,500	\$ 42,926	\$ 31,500	\$ 42,926	\$ 31,500	\$ 42,926	0.73
26-636-246-0018-00	10	6/7/2021	9999/99	\$ 25,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 21,500	\$ 27,900	\$ 21,500	\$ 27,900	\$ 21,500	\$ 27,900	0.77
26-636-239-0016-00	10	6/17/2020	4223/560	\$ 28,000	\$ 6,160	\$ 21,840	\$ 27,996	\$ 21,840	\$ 27,996	\$ 21,840	\$ 27,996	0.78
26-400-009-0008-00	10	1/28/2022	4288/258	\$ 29,900	\$ 3,500	\$ 26,400	\$ 32,637	\$ 26,400	\$ 32,637	\$ 26,400	\$ 32,637	0.81
26-770-023-0021-00	10	12/23/2020	4243/114	\$ 47,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 43,500	\$ 52,656	\$ 43,500	\$ 52,656	\$ 43,500	\$ 52,656	0.83
26-400-003-0008-00	10	9/1/2021	4273/435	\$ 36,250	\$ 2,940	\$ 33,310	\$ 39,999	\$ 33,310	\$ 39,999	\$ 33,310	\$ 39,999	0.83
26-770-008-0033-00	10	1/8/2021	4253/478	\$ 25,000	\$ 2,590	\$ 22,410	\$ 26,507	\$ 22,410	\$ 26,507	\$ 22,410	\$ 26,507	0.85
26-770-007-0014-00	10	5/15/2020	4222/672	\$ 30,500	\$ 5,250	\$ 25,250	\$ 29,572	\$ 25,250	\$ 29,572	\$ 25,250	\$ 29,572	0.85
26-770-025-0023-00	10	3/18/2021	4253/870	\$ 57,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 53,500	\$ 62,173	\$ 53,500	\$ 62,173	\$ 53,500	\$ 62,173	0.86
26-835-000-0104-00	10	11/24/2021	4282/408	\$ 42,000	\$ 2,800	\$ 39,200	\$ 44,823	\$ 39,200	\$ 44,823	\$ 39,200	\$ 44,823	0.87
26-770-009-0011-00	10	9/27/2021	4277/119	\$ 110,000	\$ 7,000	\$ 103,000	\$ 117,024	\$ 103,000	\$ 117,024	\$ 103,000	\$ 117,024	0.88
26-770-004-0032-00	10	3/24/2021	4255/310	\$ 25,000	\$ 7,000	\$ 18,000	\$ 20,332	\$ 18,000	\$ 20,332	\$ 18,000	\$ 20,332	0.89
26-770-005-0006-00	10	2/11/2022	4291/29	\$ 50,000	\$ 7,000	\$ 43,000	\$ 48,443	\$ 43,000	\$ 48,443	\$ 43,000	\$ 48,443	0.89
26-770-023-0035-00	10	6/3/2020	4222/328	\$ 35,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 31,500	\$ 35,237	\$ 31,500	\$ 35,237	\$ 31,500	\$ 35,237	0.89
26-835-000-0034-00	10	9/11/2020	4232/897	\$ 44,900	\$ 8,400	\$ 36,500	\$ 40,816	\$ 36,500	\$ 40,816	\$ 36,500	\$ 40,816	0.89
26-770-008-0017-00	10	1/12/2021	4244/810	\$ 24,900	\$ 3,500	\$ 21,400	\$ 23,803	\$ 21,400	\$ 23,803	\$ 21,400	\$ 23,803	0.90
26-310-000-0010-00	10	12/15/2020	4243/968	\$ 30,000	\$ 2,800	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	0.90
26-310-000-0010-00	10	10/15/2020	4237/746	\$ 30,000	\$ 2,800	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	\$ 27,200	\$ 30,145	0.90
26-770-027-0010-00	10	1/30/2021	4265/205	\$ 45,000	\$ 4,340	\$ 40,660	\$ 44,529	\$ 40,660	\$ 44,529	\$ 40,660	\$ 44,529	0.91
26-636-245-0024-00	10	3/4/2021	4250/167	\$ 30,000	\$ 3,500	\$ 26,500	\$ 28,923	\$ 26,500	\$ 28,923	\$ 26,500	\$ 28,923	0.92
26-770-020-0007-00	10	11/30/2021	4282/400	\$ 70,000	\$ 8,750	\$ 61,250	\$ 65,592	\$ 61,250	\$ 65,592	\$ 61,250	\$ 65,592	0.93
26-770-040-0003-00	10	7/15/2020	4227/289	\$ 32,500	\$ 3,500	\$ 29,000	\$ 30,947	\$ 29,000	\$ 30,947	\$ 29,000	\$ 30,947	0.94

26-400-009-0004-00	10	6/3/2020	4222/328	\$	35,000	\$	5,600	29,400	\$	31,012	0.95
26-770-019-0037-00	10	5/21/2021	4263/622	\$	25,000	\$	2,100	22,900	\$	23,955	0.96
26-400-016-0009-00	10	11/25/2020	4240/521	\$	26,000	\$	2,800	23,200	\$	24,201	0.96
26-400-015-0009-00	10	1/20/2021	4245/516	\$	40,000	\$	2,800	37,200	\$	38,737	0.96
26-770-023-0021-00	10	2/25/2022	4290/443	\$	54,125	\$	3,500	50,625	\$	52,656	0.96
26-770-010-0027-00	10	1/30/2021	4265/206	\$	36,000	\$	3,500	32,500	\$	33,480	0.97
26-835-000-0159-00	10	12/23/2020	4245/19	\$	50,000	\$	5,600	44,400	\$	44,564	1.00
26-835-000-0146-00	10	3/23/2021	4253/597	\$	37,000	\$	2,800	34,200	\$	34,178	1.00
26-770-003-0021-00	10	12/21/2021	4284/195	\$	41,109	\$	5,250	35,859	\$	35,467	1.01
26-770-009-0017-00	10	5/26/2021	4265/756	\$	28,000	\$	3,500	24,500	\$	23,586	1.04
26-835-000-0143-00	10	4/21/2021	4259/434	\$	60,000	\$	3,850	56,150	\$	53,089	1.06
26-400-014-0015-00	10	6/30/2021	4267/762	\$	55,000	\$	5,600	49,400	\$	43,722	1.13
26-770-003-0013-00	10	5/12/2021	4261/875	\$	85,000	\$	3,500	81,500	\$	72,122	1.13
26-770-001-0020-00	10	10/15/2021	4277/728	\$	64,900	\$	2,660	62,240	\$	52,936	1.18
26-636-240-0003-00	10	6/10/2021	4265/608	\$	59,000	\$	3,500	55,500	\$	46,994	1.18
				\$		\$	1,737,831	2,009,931	\$		0.86 ECF
											AVERAGE
											MEDIAN
											0.85
											0.89

LEFT ECF AT .858 FOR 2023.