

Muskegon County
Board of Commissioners
Hall of Justice, 990 Terrace, 4th Floor
Muskegon, MI 49442

Susie Hughes, Chairman
Marcia Hovey-Wright
Zach Lahring
Kenneth Mahoney
Charles Nash

Gary Foster, Vice Chair
Robert Scolnik
I. John Snider II
Rillastine R. Wilkins

Board Minutes may be found on the web at <https://www.co.muskegon.mi.us/AgendaCenter/Board-of-Commissioners-2>

Electronic/WebEx Regular Full Board Meeting

Tuesday, October 13, 2020
3:46 p.m.

Chairman Susie Hughes, Presiding

The Electronic/WebEx Regular Full Board Meeting of the Board of Commissioners was called to order by Chairman Susie Hughes via WebEx. An Invocation was given by Commissioner Wilkins. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited by Commissioner Mahoney.

Roll Call

Present: Gary Foster, Susie Hughes, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney,
Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins

Absent: Marcia Hovey-Wright

Also

Present: Mark Eisenbarth, County Administrator
Kristin Barnhill, Executive Assistant
Kathy Tharp, Administrative Coordinator
Nancy A. Waters, County Clerk
Linda Sue Schutter, Deputy Clerk
Michael D. Homier, Corporate Counsel

The following Commissioners were present in the Muskegon County Board of Commissioners Room: Gary Foster, Zach Lahring, Rillastine Wilkins, I. John Snider. Commissioner Mahoney arrived in the Commissioners Room, however, he felt compelled to leave and go to a conference room when Commissioner Lahring refused to wear his face mask contrary to County policy.

2020-368 **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

Moved by Commissioner Snider, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to approve the agenda.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash,
Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None

Absent: Marcia Hovey-Wright **Motion Carried**

2020-369 **APPROVE REGULAR FULL BOARD MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 22, 2020**

Moved by Commissioner Mahoney, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to approve the regular Full Board minutes of September 22, 2020.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash,
Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None

Absent: Marcia Hovey-Wright **Motion Carried**

PRESENTATION

Equalization Director Donna VanderVries shared with the Board that the Muskegon County Equalization Department received perfect scores by the State in the AMAR audits in all 13 of their assessing units. Ms. VanderVries commended her staff for their excellent work. Chairman Hughes congratulated the Equalization staff on behalf of the County Board.

Commissioner Nash congratulated Director VanderVries and her team for the good work they have done. Commissioner Mahoney supported Commissioner Nash's comments. Vice-Chair Foster suggested a letter of congratulations for the Equalization Department which Chairman Hughes approved.

Director of Public Health Kathy Moore updated the Board regarding COVID-19. As of October 12, 2020, there have been 1,635 positive cases, 72 COVID-related deaths, and there are 285 current/active positive cases. Mercy Health has 15 COVID in-patients and one patient on a ventilator. (See attached.)

PUBLIC COMMENT (on an agenda item)

None.

Commissioner Hovey-Wright joined the meeting.

COMMITTEE/BOARD REPORTS

2020-370 **AUTHORIZE THE SHERIFF'S OFFICE TO UTILIZE THE SHERIFF'S CONTRACTED VEHICLE MAINTENANCE PROVIDER TO BROKER SELLING THE USED WATCH GUARD (4RE-STD- GPS) IN-CAR VIDEO UNITS**

CPS20/10-34

The Courts and Public Safety Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Snider, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to authorize the Sheriff's Office to utilize the Sheriff's contracted vehicle maintenance provider to broker selling the used Watch Guard (4RE-STD- GPS) in-car video units.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-371 **ACCEPT THROUGH THE 2020 MICHIGAN STATE POLICE – EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT & HOMELAND SECURITY DIVISION (EMPG) REIMBURSEMENT FOR UP TO 34.83% OF THE MUSKEGON COUNTY EMERGENCY SERVICES DIRECTOR'S SALARY AND FRINGE BENEFITS**

CPS20/10-35

The Courts and Public Safety Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Snider, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to accept through the 2020 Michigan State Police – Emergency Management & Homeland Security Division (EMPG) reimbursement for up to 34.83% of the Muskegon County Emergency Services Director's salary and fringe benefits.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-372 **APPROVE ACCEPTANCE OF THE FY2021 STRATEGIC TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT GRANT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$56,079.00. (PT-21-32)**

CPS20/10-36

The Courts and Public Safety Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Snider, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to approve acceptance of the FY2021 Strategic Traffic Enforcement Grant in the amount of \$56,079.00. (PT-21-32)

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-373 **AUTHORIZE THE BOARD CHAIR TO SIGN THE AGREEMENT WITH THE WEST MICHIGAN HAZARDOUS MATERIALS ASSOCIATION EFFECTIVE FROM OCTOBER 13, 2017 TO SEPTEMBER 30, 2021**

CPS20/10-37

The Courts and Public Safety Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Snider, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to authorize the Board Chair to sign the agreement with the West Michigan Hazardous Materials Association effective from October 13, 2017 to September 30, 2021.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-374 **EXTEND THE FY20 SENIOR MILLAGE MUNICIPAL ALLOCATION THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2020**

HS20/10-24

The Human Services Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to extend the FY20 Senior Millage Municipal Allocation through December 31, 2020.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-375 **EXTEND THE FY20 SENIOR MILLAGE GRANT AWARDS THROUGH OCTOBER 31, 2020 AS FOLLOWS: CASNOVIA TOWNSHIP \$1,000; EGELSTON TOWNSHIP \$1,667; AND RAVENNA TOWNSHIP \$1,180**

HS20/10-25

The Human Services Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to extend the FY20 senior millage grant awards through October 31, 2020 as follows: Casnovia Township \$1,000; Egelston Township \$1,667; and Ravenna Township \$1,180.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-376 **APPROVE LIVING WORD CHURCH TO CARRY OVER THE REMAINING \$5,000 OF FY20 SENIOR MILLAGE GRANT FUNDS INTO FY21 FOR LAWN CARE MAINTENANCE WITH A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT ADDING SNOW REMOVAL**

HS20/10-26

The Human Services Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to approve Living Word Church to carry over the remaining \$5,000 of FY20 senior millage grant funds into FY21 for lawn care maintenance with a friendly amendment adding snow removal.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-377 **ACCEPT THE FY21 “AGREEMENT FOR EXTENSION SERVICES” IN THE AMOUNT OF \$148,594 TO COLLABORATE WITH MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY EXTENSION AND AUTHORIZE THE BOARD CHAIR TO SIGN**

HS20/10-27

The Human Services Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to accept the FY21 “Agreement for Extension Services” in the amount of \$148,594 to collaborate with Michigan State University Extension and authorize the Board Chair to sign.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-378 **EXTEND THE EGELSTON, CASNOVIA, AND RAVENNA FUNDING TO THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR, DECEMBER 31, 2020**

HS20/10-28

The Human Services Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to extend the Egelston, Casnovia, and Ravenna funding to the end of the calendar year, December 31, 2020.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

2020-379 **APPROVE PAYMENT OF THE ACCOUNTS PAYABLE OF \$17,154,967.72 COVERING THE PERIOD OF SEPTEMBER 4, 2020 THROUGH SEPTEMBER 24, 2020 FOR CHECKS, EFT AND PCard PAYMENTS COVERING THE PERIOD AUGUST 1, 2020 THROUGH AUGUST 31, 2020 AS PRESENTED BY THE COUNTY CLERK**

WM20/10-87

The Ways & Means Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Scolnik, seconded by Commissioner Snider, to approve payment of the accounts payable of \$17,154,967.72 covering the period of September 4, 2020 through September 24, 2020 for checks, EFT and PCard payments covering the period August 1, 2020 through August 31, 2020 as presented by the County Clerk.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: Zach Lahring **Motion Carried**

2020-380 **APPROVE THE CONTRACT BETWEEN THE COUNTY OF MUSKEGON/MUSKEGON COUNTY AIRPORT AND THE NORTON SHORES FIRE DEPARTMENT TO PROVIDE AIRPORT RESCUE AND FIRE FIGHTING (ARFF) SERVICES FOR THE AIRPORT, PER THE FAA'S FAR PART 139 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIRPORTS PROVIDING COMMERCIAL AIR SERVICE. THE DURATION OF THE CONTRACT IS FIVE (5) YEARS, WITH A PROVISION TO RENEW THE CONTRACT FOR AN ADDITIONAL FIVE YEARS.**

WM20/10-88

The Ways & Means Committee recommended, moved by Commissioner Scolnik, seconded by Commissioner Snider, to approve the contract between the County of Muskegon/Muskegon County Airport and the Norton Shores Fire Department to provide Airport Rescue and Fire Fighting (ARFF) services for the airport, per the FAA's FAR Part 139 requirements for airports providing commercial air service. The duration of the contract is five (5) years, with a provision to renew the contract for an additional five years.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None

Motion Carried

CHAIRMAN'S REPORT/COMMITTEE LIAISON REPORTS

Chairman Hughes reported to the Board that the parks had a very busy season and she is happy to report that they had their best season ever because people were outdoors. Camping in the parks closed on October 4th, but the parks will remain open all winter long. <https://www.muskegoncountyparks.com>

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

2020-381 **APPROVE ENTERING INTO A 5 YEAR LEASE AGREEMENT WITH REV FINANCIAL SERVICES FOR 5 SUV INTERCEPTOR VEHICLES FOR A VALUE OF \$234,100.20 AT AN INTEREST RATE OF 2.67% PENDING CORPORATE COUNSEL REVIEW OF THE LEASE AGREEMENT AND AUTHORIZE THE BOARD CHAIR TO SIGN THE AGREEMENT UPON COMPLETION OF THAT REVIEW**

It was recommended by Administrator Eisenbarth, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Vice-Chair Foster, to approve entering into a 5-year lease agreement with REV Financial Services for five SUV interceptor vehicles for a value of \$234,100.20 at an interest rate of 2.67% pending corporate counsel review of the lease agreement and authorize the board chair to sign the agreement upon completion of that review. (See attached.)

Commissioner Scolnik and Commissioner Lahring inquired about the previous lease agreement with Ford Credit. The Administrator indicated that this lease agreement is for all five vehicles at a lower rate.

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

Attorney Homier explained that the previous motion approved on September 8 included one vehicle under Ford Credit. On March 10, 2020, motions were approved which indicated that the vehicles would be leased from Ford Credit *or a leasing company most advantageous to the County*. This is why this motion came back to the Board because all five vehicles would be leased through REV Financial Services at a much lower than that of Ford Credit.

2020-382 **ENTER INTO BASIC LEVEL OF SERVICE AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF MUSKEGON HEIGHTS FOR THE PURPOSE OF OFFICIAL-USE ACCESS TO MUSKEGON COUNTY'S GEOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION SYSTEM (GIS) FOR A ONE-TIME NEW MEMBERSHIP FEE OF \$2,700.00 AND AUTHORIZE THE BOARD CHAIR TO SIGN THE AGREEMENT**

Recommended by Administrator Eisenbarth, moved by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Commissioner Wilkins, to enter into Basic Level of Service agreement with the City of Muskegon Heights for the purpose of official-use access to Muskegon County's Geographical Information System (GIS) for a one-time new membership fee of \$2,700.00 and authorize the Board Chair to sign the agreement. (See attached.)

Roll call:

Yes: Gary Foster, Marcia Hovey-Wright, Zach Lahring, Kenneth Mahoney, Charles Nash, Robert Scolnik, I. John Snider II, Rillastine R. Wilkins, Susie Hughes

No: None **Motion Carried**

OLD BUSINESS

HS20/09-23 was postponed on September 8, 2020, for 30 days to bring before the Senior Activities Committee - To approve reinstating Ravenna, Casnovia, and Egelston the allocation to extend the senior meals and reinstate the snowplowing program three months to December 31, 2020.

Vice-Chair Foster indicated that this motion is no longer applicable since it was already handled under Human Services.

NEW BUSINESS

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Tony Barnes, Dalton Township Supervisor, addressed the Board to recognize Ravenna Township residents, Mike and Brett Postema, who stepped up and went above and beyond. The residents helped DNR officers find a woman lost in the woods for two nights. The Muskegon County Sheriff's Department also assisted, plus other first responders who are all appreciated.

Christopher Cross addressed the Board about the snow removal service since it is not clear about the funding. Mr. Cross thought Commissioners found this a necessary program, but the \$5,000 funding is inadequate. Chairman Hughes said she would have someone get back to him.

Commissioner Hovey-Wright indicated we needed to address the snow removal program again.

Ryan Leestma commented on the fiasco of last week's committee meeting and the appropriateness of the County's policy on COVID and in-person meetings.

Chairman Hughes asked for clarification about the motion that was tabled under Old Business. Commissioner Hovey-Wright indicated that the wording of Motion HS20/09-23 was not in any of the above Human Services motions.

Commissioner Nash indicated that Motion HS20/10-26 extended the \$5,000 for grass cutting and snow removal. The Senior Activities Committee is trying to get a final balance of the funds that are left and find other opportunities to handle requests.

Commissioner Hovey-Wright indicated the Senior Activities Committee will be meeting next Tuesday, October 20.

Commissioner Lahring remarked that Motion HS20/10-28 is not the same as the old business motion.

Chairman Hughes said that Motion HS20/09-23 will come back to the Board through other meetings and it will be back on the agenda before winter.

FINAL BOARD COMMENTS

Chairman Hughes addressed a public comment from today. Chairman Hughes indicated that Administrator Eisenbarth did everything in his power to resolve the hacking situation last week. Zoom is not a part of the County IT Department and there was nothing IT, the Commissioners, or Administration could have done to prevent this. The County has now returned to WebEx which is more secure for the Board meetings.

Administrator Eisenbarth indicated that the Closed Session is no longer necessary.

2020-383 **MOVED TO ADJOURN**

Motion to adjourn.

Meeting adjourned at 4:34 p.m.

Nancy A. Waters, County Clerk

NAW/lss

To be approved at the next Full Board meeting.