

Muskegon County
Solid Waste Planning Commission
May 4, 2016
3:00 p.m.
Training Center
97 E. Apple Avenue, Room 119
Muskegon, Michigan 49442

Jim Fisher, Chair

Kim Arter, Vice Chair

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Greg Leverage at 3:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: Jerry Garman, Kerry Rattinger, Kim Arter, Chris Hall, Jim Fisher, Kathy Evans, Mohammed Al-Shatel, Sidney Shaw, Terry Sladick, Commissioner Lohman

Excused: Wayne Kuerth, Russ Jones, Vicki Webster-Luthy

Absent: William Crabtree

Staff

Present: Greg Leverage, Solid Waste Supervisor; John Warner, Director of Public Works; Tina Nash, Public Works Departmental Clerk

INTRODUCTIONS

Members of the Committee and staff took turns introducing themselves.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Greg Leverage asked for nominations for Chair.

Jim Fisher expressed he would like to be Chair.

There were no other nominations for Chair.

SWPC-16-001 It was moved by Chris Hall, supported by Mohammed Al-Shatel, to close the nominations for Chair and elect Jim Fisher as Chair.

Roll call:

Yes – Garman, Rattinger, Arter, Hall, Fisher, Evans, Al-Shatel, Shaw, Sladick, Lohman

No – None

Excused – Kuerth, Jones, Webster-Luthy

Absent – Crabtree

Motion carried

Chair Fisher presiding.

Chair Fisher opened nominations for Vice Chair for the Solid Waste Planning Committee.

Kim Arter requested to be Vice Chair.

There were no other nominations for Vice Chair.

It was moved by Jerry Garman, seconded by Commissioner Lohman to nominate Kim Arter for Vice Chair.

SWPC-16-002 It was moved by Mohammed Al-Shatel, supported by Kathy Evans, to close the nominations for Vice Chair and elect Kim Arter as Vice Chair.

Voice Vote: **Motion carried**

Chair Fisher asked for nominations for Secretary. It was noted that this person needed to be an employee of Muskegon County Department of Public Works.

SWPC-16-003 It was moved by Mohammed Al-Shatel, supported by Jerry Garman, to close the nominations for Secretary and elect Greg Leverage as Secretary.

Voice Vote: **Motion carried**

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

It was suggested by Mohammed Al-Shatel to set goals for each meeting.

SWPC-16-004 It was moved by Mohammed Al-Shatel, seconded by Kerry Rattinger to approve the agenda as presented.

Voice Vote: **Motion carried**

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

SWPC-16-005 It was moved by Kerry Rattinger, seconded by Kim Arter, to approve the minutes of the February 5, 2015 meeting as presented.

Voice Vote: **Motion carried**

ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

Solid Waste Landfill Expansion Update

Greg Leverence presented to the Committee a proposal for future solid waste disposal/recycling in order to seek future approval for consistency with the County Solid Waste Plan. Greg Leverence stated this was the same presentation given to the Wastewater Users Group. (See attached)

At 3:26 p.m. Commissioner Lohman asked to speak to Greg Leverence and John Warner in the hall. Meeting was paused during this time.

At 3:29 p.m. Commissioner Lohman, Greg Leverence and John Warner returned to the room and the presentation continued. Commissioner Lohman expressed this was only a proposal.

Chris Hall asked Greg Leverence if they could go with less property if this doesn't work out. Greg Leverence stated they could; however because the County has this land their possession he would like to secure a square mile for the future use. Kathy Evans asked about the current capacity. Greg Leverence stated it was 10 years. Jerry Garman asked if that was based on the current waste rate. Greg Leverence stated it was.

Kathy Evans asked if they would be working with an engineering firm to avoid

impacting the drainage. Greg Leverence stated they would be.

Chair Fisher asked if this Committee gives final approval or if the County Board gives final approval. John Warner stated it would need to go to the County Board and it was this Committee's charge to determine if this is or is not consistent with the County Solid Waste Management Plan.

Chair Fisher stated the bylaws needed to be clear as to the Committee's roll and authority. John Warner stated they would bring back a clarifying paragraph at the next meeting for consideration.

Discussion ensued.

Jerry Garman asked if this does happen, how far in advanced would they need approval from this Committee. Greg Leverence stated if they are able to secure rights to the property, they would like to get going on it right away.

Chair Fisher asked if there was a proposed timeline. Greg Leverence stated nothing concrete.

Recycling Study

Chair Fisher had Nick Occhipinti introduce himself. Nick Occhipinti is the Policy Director for West Michigan Environmental Action Council.

Greg Leverence gave an update on the proposal and stated that staff is in the process of reviewing and rating the three (3) proposals received from GT Environmental, Gershman, Brickner and Bratton (GBB) and Resource Recycling Systems (RRS).

Chair Fisher asked Greg Leverence if the recommended vendor would be ran by the Committee.

Discussion ensued regarding the review process, staff currently involved in the review process, funding and timeline.

Chair Fisher asked who on the Board would like to review the proposal. Kim Arter, Chris Hall, Sidney Shaw, Kathy Evans and Commissioner Lohman all raised their hands. Kim Arter, Sidney Shaw and Kathy Evans were selected.

Nick Occhipinti presented on recycling and the Stakeholder Initiative. Nick Occhipinti stated it is the Governor's call to double the recycling rate in Michigan in the next two years. Nick Occhipinti spoke on the waste sort hosted by the landfill and the findings. Nick Occhipinti stated that due to economic issues the recycling market is depressed right now; however there is still value in some of the materials. Nick Occhipinti thanked Greg Leverence and John Warner for including input from Stakeholder's in the proposal. Nick Occhipinti stated that the Recycling Study is important because they don't have all the data needed to make decisions. Commissioner Lohman stated he is happy this is moving forward. Commissioner Lohman asked if the \$20,000 Alcoa grant was going toward the cost of the study. Nick Occhipinti stated that was a separate project for outreach and education.

Chair Fisher stated a special meeting may need to be called to spend time to go over the bylaws, the County Solid Waste Plan and to determine what this Committee's roll is going forward.

Permanent Committee Meeting Schedule

It was agreed by the Committee to continue with the current meeting schedule of February, May, August and November on the first Wednesday of the month at 3:00 p.m. with cancellation if no agenda items. Special meetings may be called as needed.

SWPC-16-006 It was moved by Mohammed Al-Shatel, seconded by Commissioner Lohman, to approve the meeting schedule.

Voice Vote: **Motion carried**

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Commissioner Lohman asked if all the general public spots were filled. Commissioner Lohman stated he was surprised that a representative from Moorland Township was not on the Committee. It was stated that all positions were filled. Chair Fisher suggested that they may amend the bylaws to include another member. John Warner stated that he would need to check to see if that was legally permissible due to the fourteen (14) slots being dictated by Part 115 Act 451. Chair Fisher asked John Warner to look into that. John Warner agreed.

Greg Leverage will send the Committee the link to the Solid Waste Plan, the Strategic Plan and an updated list of the Committee members including the slots they represent.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

Solid Waste Planning Committee
Minutes
May 4, 2016
Page 7

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Solid Waste Planning Committee the meeting was adjourned at 4:18 p.m.

Jim Fisher, Chair

Muskegon County
Solid Waste Planning Committee
Special Meeting
June 27, 2016
8:00 a.m.
Training Center
97 E. Apple Avenue, Room 119
Muskegon, Michigan 49442

Jim Fisher, Chair

Kim Arter, Vice Chair

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Jim Fisher at 8:05 a.m.

ROLL

Present: Jerry Garman, Kerry Rattinger, Kim Arter, Jim Fisher, Sidney Shaw, Terry Sladick, Commissioner Lohman, William Crabtree, Wayne Kuerth, Vicki Webster-Luthy

Excused: Chris Hall, Kathy Evans, Russ Jones, Mohammed Al-Shatel

Staff

Present: Greg Leverage, Solid Waste Supervisor; Sara Damm, Sustainability Coordinator

SWPC-16-006 APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

Moved by Jerry Garman, seconded by Kerry Rattinger, to approve the minutes of the May 4, 2016 meeting as presented.

VOICE VOTE: **Motion carried**

REPORTS OF COMMITTEE

Commissioner Lohman presented to the Committee the review process that took place to review the three proposals that were submitted to Public Works staff in response to the Request for Proposals (RFP). Staff received three proposals; GBB, RRS, and GT Environmental. Each proposal was reviewed by four County staff, and four Committee members to give each company a numerical score for various categories. It was concluded that each company was very well suited to conduct the work, but after all items were considered, including cost, it was determined that GBB would be the recommended company for the Recycle Study. Greg Leverage pointed out that GBB is currently working with Kent County for consulting services, so that could be the reason they were the lowest cost while still being able to handle the project. The recommendation will be brought to the Board of Public Works meeting on July 14, 2016.

SWPC-16-007 Recommend award of the Muskegon County Recycling Study RFP 16-2216 to Gershman, Brickner & Bratton, Inc. to the Muskegon County Board of Public Works.

It was moved by Commissioner Lohman, seconded by Jerry Garman, to recommend award of the Muskegon County Recycling Study RFP 16-2216 to Gershman, Brickner & Bratton, Inc. to the Muskegon County Board of Public Works at the July meeting.

VOICE VOTE: **Motion carried**

OLD BUSINESS

Greg Leverage will follow up with sending the meeting schedule, link to the Solid Waste Plan, list of committee members, and staff summary of the Strategic Plan from 2015.

NEW BUSINESS

Vicki Webster-Luthy requested that a residential group (specifically Moorland Township residents) should be included in any communication so they're aware of how the County is moving forward. Chair Fisher also requested that staff email Steve Kloosterman at mLive about moving forward with GBB, which will be guided by the Solid Waste Planning Committee in conjunction with a community stakeholder group.

AUDIENC PARTICIPATION

None

NEXT REGULAR MEETING

August 3, 2016 at 3:00 p.m.

This meeting may also be the initial introduction to the GBB consultants. Staff will send out additional information.

ADJOURN

There being no further business to come before the Solid Waste Planning Committee the meeting was adjourned at 9:18 a.m.

Jim Fisher, Chair

Muskegon County
Solid Waste Planning Committee
August 3, 2016
3:00 p.m.
Training Center
97 E. Apple Avenue, Room 119
Muskegon, Michigan 49442

Jim Fisher, Chair

Kim Arter, Vice Chair

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Jim Fisher at 3:00 p.m.

ROLL

Present: Kerry Rattinger, Kim Arter, Jim Fisher, Sidney Shaw, Terry Sladick, Commissioner Lohman, William Crabtree, Vicki Webster-Luthy, Chris Hall, Kathy Evans, Russ Jones

Excused: Jerry Garman, Mohammed Al-Shatel, Wayne Kuerth

Staff

Present: Greg Leverage, Solid Waste Supervisor; Sara Damm, Sustainability Coordinator; Mark Eisenbarth, Administrator; Doug Hughes, Corporate Council; Christina Miller, MDEQ Solid Waste Planning Staff; Lizzy Paul, MSU Sustainability Intern

SWPC-16-008 APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

Moved by Commissioner Lohman, seconded by Kim Arter, to approve the minutes of the July 27, 2016 special meeting as presented.

VOICE VOTE: **Motion carried**

COMMUNICATIONS

Doug Hughes, Corporate Council, presented a letter from Williams | Hughes PLLC dated July 28, 2016. The letter is a written analysis of the solid waste statute (Public Act 451 of 1994) which describes the role of the solid waste planning committee.

The basic role of the committee per the Solid Waste Act is to assist the county in its preparation of a solid waste management plan. The Solid Waste Act requires that the plan:

1. Contain enforceable mechanisms for implementing the plan;
2. Identify municipalities within the county responsible for the enforcement and my contain a mechanism for the county and those municipalities to assist the department and the state police in implementing and conducting the inspection program;
3. Recognize a sufficient amount of available and suitable land;
4. Identify solid waste disposal areas or resource recovery facilities for a five year period that are capable

- of being developed and operated in compliance with state law and rules; and
5. Include a timetable or schedule for implementing the solid waste management plan.

The department sets forth additional responsibilities of the planning committee. Under the rules, the planning committee must do both of the following:

1. Prepare the plan by providing advice and consultation, which includes:
 - a. Reviewing the designated planning agency's work program,
 - b. Identifying local policies and priorities,
 - c. Insuring coordination and public participation,
 - d. Advising counties or municipalities,
 - e. Reviewing work elements, and
 - f. Approving the plan, and
2. Assure that the planning agency is fulfilling all the requirements of the Solid Waste Act and rules as to both the content of the plan and the public participation. The committee must notify the planning agency of any deficiencies.

Bylaws, which have not been updated since 2007, can be updated to reflect the additional responsibilities of the planning committee to insure active involvement in managing the solid waste and recycling in Muskegon County.

Chairman Fisher mentioned appointing a sub-committee to focus on a plan review in parallel with the recycle study to develop the plan amendments.

Christina Miller noted that the Director of DEQ initiates the update process, which was only done in 1997, and in 2002 DEQ wanted to change the update process to reduce redundancies and consider the impacts on DEQ staff. However, counties can amend their plans at any time.

OLD BUSINESS

Greg Leverence announced the award of the Recycle Study to GBB by the Public Works Board. Greg Leverence and Sara Damm will hold a kick-off conference call with Kate Vasquez and Lori Scozzafava on August 4th to discuss the schedule and kick-off meeting here in Muskegon, presumably on August 30th. Greg Leverence will send out an email to announce the Special Meeting of the committee.

NEW BUSINESS

- A. Expanded role of SWPC:
 - a. Mark Eisenbarth discussed the expanded role of the SWPC: The Board of Commissioners request input from committees when making decisions, so it's important that department directors and staff are engaging the committees more often. Sub-committees within committee are encouraged to focus on plan amendments. This will help with engaging the group and ensuring the involvement of the committee with future plans and initiatives and partnerships. He complimented the committee on being more proactive instead of waiting for the State to require a plan update. He also mentioned that the landfill is owned by Muskegon County, and it's here to serve the community.
 - b. Chairman Fisher mentioned that establishing recycling as a priority is crucial. He would like everyone on the committee to be on a sub-committee, possibly splitting the plan into sections so each sub-committee can focus on pre-determined sections.
- B. Solid Waste Policy update:
 - a. Christina Miller (MDEQ) explained the history of the Solid Waste Management Plans in Michigan. Previous plans were focused on disposal capacity, requiring landfills to be sited

when there was only 10 years of capacity left. Currently, there's 27 years of disposal capacity state-wide, which is relatively excessive and leads to the difficulty in recycling. In 2014, there was the Governor's Recycling Initiative that stated the desire to double the recycling rates in Michigan within 2 years. Grants went out to help local municipalities and non-profits help meet those goals, but more was needed from a legislative perspective. In April 2015, the Solid Waste and Sustainability Advisory Panel was formed to comprehensively review Part 115, Solid Waste Management, of the Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Act, 1994 PA 451, as amended. Currently, the group, comprised of a multitude of stakeholder representatives, put together SWSAP Proposals for a public meeting that was held on July 20, 2016. These proposals would then need to be submitted to the Director of MDEQ, draft legislation would need to be created, then a legislator would need to sponsor the bill before it can make it through for final approval. This is a lengthy timeline, so continuing the update process of the current Solid Waste Plan is advised. DEQ staff is willing to help when needed.

- b. Greg Leverence will send a link to the SWSAP proposed changes, and noted that Kent County DPW Director sits on that panel.
- C. Stakeholder group existence and utilization:
- a. Chairman Fisher explained the timing of the SWPC strategic planning session (to be placed on file with these minutes) and the motion made to advise the Board to direct staff to significantly increase recycling rates. During the strategic planning session, more questions than answers arose, which will then feed into the Recycling Study.
 - b. Sara Damm explained that the larger recycling stakeholder group came about during a conversation with Nick Occipinti from West Michigan Environmental Action Council (WMEAC) during the Michigan Recycling Coalition conference in 2015. Because the SWPC group wasn't meeting regularly, WMEAC (with funding from the Community Foundation) and County staff worked together to put together a plan to bring together business and municipal leaders from both Muskegon and Grand Rapids. The initial meetings were to get an understanding behind the City of Grand Rapids vast improvements surrounding recycling, their method of funding, and how an environmental economist from GVSU noted that the "Pay-As-You-Throw" method was the most effective way to increase participation. The stakeholders also made recommendations of who should be invited to the larger group, many of which were also on the SWPC. Not every municipality was reached, but many are coming forward to be part of the larger group. Future meetings will reach out to all municipalities so everyone can meet the GBB consultants and get updated on the process being done by the County and the SWPC. The stakeholder group is more of an information sharing group that could potentially turn into partnerships for future implementation. Chairman Fisher advised that staff bring together the Stakeholder group two times per year to help move the process forward.
- D. Alcoa grant work:
- a. Sara Damm spoke about the Alcoa Foundation grant that will be funding \$20,000 which will include a new Sustainable Muskegon logo/branding, a website that will include recycling information similar to the Household Recycling and Disposal Guide, and working with WMEAC to bring more sustainability and recycling lesson plans into Muskegon County schools. The grant ends September 2017. The new logo will be sent to the SWPC for input, and will send the website test link when it's ready.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

NEXT MEETING

There will be a special meeting of the SWPC on Tuesday, 30 August 2016 at 8:30 AM, location TBD.

This meeting will be the initial introduction to the GBB consultants. Staff will send out additional information.

Solid Waste Planning Committee Minutes
August 3, 2016
Page 4

ADJOURN

There being no further business to come before the Solid Waste Planning Committee the meeting was adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

Jim Fisher, Chair